ΣΧΟΛΗ

ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

VOLUME 8

ISSUE 2

2014

CHOICE · LAW · POWER · ARGUMENT

ΣΧΟΛΗ (Schole)

Ancient Philosophy and the Classical Tradition

Editor-in-Chief
Eugene V. Afonasin (Novosibirsk)

Executive Secretary
Anna S. Afonasina (Novosibirsk)

Reviews and Bibliography
Michael V. Egorochkin (Moscow)

Editorial Board

Igor V. Berestov (Novosibirsk), Pavel A. Butakov (Novosibirsk), John Dillon (Dublin), Svetlana V. Mesyats (Moscow), Dominic O'Meara (Friburg), Eugene V. Orlov (Novosibirsk), Vadim B. Prozorov (Moscow), Andrei I. Schetnikov (Novosibirsk), Teun Tieleman (Utrecht), Marina N. Wolf (Novosibirsk)

Advisory Committee

Sergey S. Avanesov (Tomsk), Leonidas Bargeliotes (Athens–Ancient Olympia), Luc Brisson (Paris), Levan Gigineishvili (Tbilisi), Vasily P. Goran (Novosibirsk), Vladimir S. Diev (Novosibirsk), Sergey P. Shevtsov (Odessa), Vitaly V. Tselitschev (Novosibirsk), Alexey V. Tzyb (St. Petersburg)

Established at

Novosibirsk State University
Institute of Philosophy and Law (Novosibirsk, Russia)

The journal is published twice a year since March 2007

The address for correspondence
Philosophy Department, Novosibirsk State University,
Pirogov Street, 2, Novosibirsk, 630090, Russia

E-mail addresses:
Articles and translations: **afonasin@gmail.com**
Reviews and bibliography: **egorochkin@torba.com**

On-line version: **www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/**

ISSN 1995-4328 (Print)
ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

© The Center for Ancient Philosophy and the Classical Tradition, 2007–2014

СОДЕРЖАНИЕ / CONTENTS

Предисловие редактора / Editorial 134

ПЕРЕВОДЫ / TRANSLATIONS

Амвросий Медиоланский. *О благе смерти* 136
Е. П. Аристова, предисловие, перевод, примечания

Трактат *О не-сущем, или О природе* Горгия в *De Melisso Xenophane* 198
Gorgia, V–VI: Условно-формальная структура и перевод
М. Н. Вольф, предисловие, перевод, примечания

РЕЦЕНЗИИ И БИБЛИОГРАФИЯ / REVIEWS AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

«Дедалы речей». Софистика в современных исследованиях 217
М. Н. Вольф

И. Р. Тантлевский. *Загадки рукописей Мертвого моря: История и учение общины Кумрана*. Санкт-Петербург: РХГА, 2011 244
А. А. Хлевов

Платон и Атлантида. Обзор книги: Rudberg, Gunnar. *Atlantis and Syracuse*. Norderstedt: Books on Demand GmbH, 2012 249
А. С. Афонасина

Порфирий об одушевлении эмбриона. Заметки к книге: Luc Brisson et al. (ed.) *Porphyre. Sur la manière don't l'embryon reçoit l'âme*. Paris: Librairie Philosophique J. Vrin, 2012 257
Е. В. Афонасин

СТАТЬИ / ARTICLES

Выбор · Право · Власть · Аргумент
Choice · Law · Power · Argument

Софистика – это не аргументация 268
Е. Н. Лисанюк

Бесконечный лжец 285
В. А. Ладов

Правила, юридический язык и речевые акты 293
В. В. Оглезнев, В. А. Суровцев

Концептуальный анализ в философии права: границы применимости 303
В. В. Оглезнев

Термин «proairesis» и богословие личности …… 312
Иеромонах Мефодий Зинковский

Лукреций Кар: и рационалистический детерминизм, и иррационалистический индетерминизм ……... 328
В. П. Горан

Боэций и Райл об эпистемическом фатализме …….. 339
Е. В. Борисов

Король, Папа и Император: проблема легитимности светской власти в «Семи Партидах» и глоссе Грегорио Лопеса ……... 347
А. В. Марей

Понятие справедливости в трудах Исидора Севильского ……... 365
Е. С. Марей

Семиозис власти в семантическом типе культуры ……... 378
С. В. Санников

К вопросу о значении термина *hybris* в архаический период ……..... 399
С. П. Шевцов

Современные теории естественного права и классическая традиция ... 418
А. Б. Дидикин

Varia

«Мудрая» Сапфо или философия древнегреческой инициации …… 425
Т. Г. Мякин

Философия как литература: способы представления ……... 445
О. А. Донских

Протестантский и католический неоаристотелизм в немецкой философии XIX в. Франц Брентано о многозначности сущего у Аристотеля 454
Р. А. Громов

Античная медицинская симптоматология и современная семиотическая теория ……... 473
Е. А. Найман

«О граде Божьем» и современная философия истории или что нам могут сказать размышления Августина об истории ……. 480
В. Н. Сыров, С. Ю. Суханова

Математический платонизм ……. 492
В. В. Целищев

Relations in the Trinitarian Reality: Two approaches …… 505
Pavel Butakov

Владимир Эрн как читатель Платона …….. 520
М. Ю. Немцев

«Лисид»: опыт аксиологического комментария …… 537
С. С. Аванесов

Etymology of the Nickname *'Iskariṓt(h)*: the "One Who Saw a Sign" [('i)sqar(î)'ôṯ/yisqar(î)'ôṯ] or the "One Who Slandered/Betrayed a Sign" [('i)šqar(î)'ôṯ/yišqar(î)'ôṯ]? …… 545
Igor Tantlevskij

Аннотации / Abstracts …….. 549

EDITORIAL

Along with a number of articles and reviews on subjects, traditional to the journal, the second issue of the eighth volume of ΣΧΟΛΗ contains a series of studies on the history and philosophy of law, political thought and the theory of argumentation in Antiquity accomplished in the framework of an interdisciplinary project, jointly conducted by the departments of philosophy of Tomsk and Novosibirsk universities. We build upon one of our previous issue, dedicated to the history and philosophy of law (vol. 4, issue 1), as well as on various publications on the subjects, found elsewhere in the journal.

Besides, I would like to point out that starting from this issue we decided to expand our team and invited Dr. Michael Egorochkin of Moscow Institute of philosophy to deal with the growing number of reviews received by the editorial board. All reviews and bibliographic outlines should be directed to him. Note that these contributions should adhere to the same rules as articles and translations.

Our next thematic issue (January 2015) will be dedicated to natural sciences in Antiquity. Studies and translations are due by November 2014. Interested persons are welcome to contribute.

I wish to express my gratitude to all those friends and colleagues who participate in our collective projects and seminars and would like to remind that the journal is abstracted / indexed in *The Philosopher's Index* and *SCOPUS,* wherefore the prospective authors are kindly requested to supply their contributions with substantial abstracts and the lists of keywords. All the issues of the journal are available online at the following addresses: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/ (journal's home page); www.elibrary.ru (Russian Index of Scientific Quotations); and www.ceeol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).

Eugene Afonasin
Lisbon, Portugal
June 23, 2014
afonasin@gmail.com

Abstracts

Ekaterina Aristova
The Russian State University for Humanities, Moscow, aristovaar@gmail.com
Ambrose of Milan, *Death as a Good* (*De bono mortis*)
An introduction, a Russian translation and notes
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 136–197
Keywords: Fathers of Church, Neoplatonism, creationism, human, sin, body, matter, senses, affect, soul.
Abstract. Two sermons of Ambrose of Milan, the "Death as a good" and "On Isaac or on the soul," are sometimes called "Plotinian sermons" because of the abundance of the hidden citations from the Neoplatonic philosopher in the text and the overall impression of otherworldliness and detestation to body they leave after reading. These texts can't really be called "Plotinian" in the proper sense of the word, of course. In the universe, as Ambrose sees it, there is no place for a 'Neoplatonic' hierarchy of entities, ranked according to their proximity to the universal source; matter is not considered as a universe principle, but as a sort of bodily resistance to the soul. Body as well as soul appears as a fragile created thing, and corporality fighting with mind becomes a consequence, not a condition of the soul's sinful fall. For the sake of the audience's admonition Ambrose develops an original version of Christian anthropology and examines the connection between soul and body, introducing the term "affection" to describe their reciprocal influence: someone can be called "human" only thanks to his conversion to God, and the restoration of the perfection of his human nature and the harmony between soul and body can be achieved by the means of innate action of the Creator.

Marina Wolf
Institute of Philosophy and Law, Novosibirsk State University, Russia, rina.volf@gmail.com
Gorgias' "On Not-Being or On Nature" in *De Melisso Xenophane Gorgia*, V–VI: its formal structure and a translation from the Greek into Russian
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 198–216
Keywords: sophistic, the Sophists, Gorgias, "On Not-Being or On Nature", argumentation.
Abstract. The Pseudo-Aristotelian (Anonymous) *De Melisso Xenophane Gorgia,* along with the well-known evidence of Sextus Empiricus (*Adv. Math.* 7.65–87), interests scholars as a major evidence about Gorgias's treatise "On Not-Being or On Nature". The paper (1) offers the first Russian translation of the section of the *De Melisso Xenophane Gorgia*, V–VI, which concerns Gorgias; and (2) analyses the sources and the formal structure of the argument in the treatise.

Marina Wolf
Institute of Philosophy and Law, Novosibirsk State University, Russia, rina.volf@gmail.com
"Logodaidaloi": The Sophistic in Contemporary Studies
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 217–248

KEYWORDS: Ancient philosophy, rhetoric, argumentation, the Presocratics, the Pre-Sophists, the Sophists, Protagoras, Gorgias.
ABSTRACT. The article reviews a number of recent edition and translations of the Sophists' fragments (including these published in Russia), and offers a critical bibliographic overview of the sophistic studies in the western (mostly Anglo-American) history of philosophy during the last sixty years. It examines some interpretations of the doctrines of the Older Sophists (esp. Protagoras and Gorgias) and analyses the most conspicuous lines taken by contemporary scholars in relation to these characters.

ALEXANDER KHLEVOV
The Russian Christian Humanitarian Academy, St. Petersburg, hlevov@mail.ru
IGOR R. TANTLEVSKIJ. THE DEAD SEA SCROLLS. THE HISTORY AND TEACHING OF THE QUMRAN SOCIETY. ST. PETERSBURG: RUSSIAN CHRISTIAN ACADEMY OF HUMANITIES, 2013. 352 P.
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 244–248
KEYWORDS: Judaism, The Dead Sea Scrolls, religious communities, religious leaders.
ABSTRACT. The reviewer analyses Igor Tantlevskij's reconstruction of the history of the Qumran community as well as his identifications of the key personages mentioned in the main sectarians scrolls under symbolic designations. Special attention is given to the consideration of the author's methods of analysis of the theological and religious doctrines of the Qumranites, especially the messianic, eschatological, and soteriological ones.

ANNA AFONASINA
Tomsk State University, afonasina@gmail.com
PLATO AND ATLANTIS. A review of: Rudberg, Gunnar. *Atlantis and Syracuse. Did Plato's Experience on Sicily Inspire the Legend? A Study on Plato's Later Political Writings*. Translated by C. Murphy, edited by Th. C. Franke. Norderstedt: Books on Demand GmbH, 2012. – 120 p.
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 249–256
KEYWORDS: Plato, Critias, Timaeus, Atlantis, Sicily, Syracuse.
ABSTRACT. The book by Gunnar Rudberg is dedicated to the well-known and exciting legend on Atlantis. The author carefully considers different opinions, starting from late antiquity and finishing with the beginning of the twentieth century. The main question that he proposes to answer is: Did anything in reality correspond to the Plato's story or it must be taken as a pure invention by the Athenian philosopher? Did he invent the island with this unique political structure or took some polis as a prototype? Having considered various hypotheses proposed by the scholars from Antiquity to the present times, he himself suggests that at the time of Plato the Sicilian Syracuse could be such an example and concludes that this city had become Plato's prototype.

EUGENE AFONASIN
Tomsk State University, afonasin@gmail.com
PORPHYRY, ON HOW EMBRYOS ARE ENSOULED. A review of: Luc Brisson, Gwenaëlle Aubry, Marie-Hélène Congourdeau, Françoise Hudry et al. (ed.) Porphyre. *Sur la manière don't l'embryon reçoit l'âme*. Traduction anglaise par Michael Chase. Paris: Librairie Philosophique J. Vrin, 2012. – 384 pp.
LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 257–267
KEYWORDS: Ancient psychology, embryology, fetus, prenatal development, Platonism, Hippocratic medicine, soul.
ABSTRACT. In this small treatise the Neoplatonic philosopher Porphyry (234–305) addresses the question, problematic to every Platonic philosopher, this of agency of the preexistent human soul. Are the embryos already in possession of the self-moving descended souls and thus already living beings? In order to answer the question Porphyry first tries to show that embryos are not actually animals and thus can more properly be compared with plants. The second set of arguments is aimed to show that they are not animals even potentially. Finally Porphyry argues that, regardless the time of its entry, the self-moving soul comes from outside, not from the parents. The final chapter of the treatise is unfortunately not preserved, but the answer given by the philosopher is clear: a particular soul enters an appropriate body immediately after its birth and harmonically attuned to it for the rest of the bodily life. The article discusses new excellent commented editions of the treatise by T. Dorandi and his colleagues (Brisson et al. 2012) and by J. Wilberding (2011) and proposes suggestions for their improvement.

ELENA LISANYUK
St. Petersburg State University, Russia, elenalisanyuk@gmail.com
SOPHISTIC VS ARGUMENTATION: THE WAYS OF DEMARCATION
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 268–284
KEYWORDS: sophistic, argumentation, discussion, illegitimate argument, Protagoras, Euathlus, sophismata.
ABSTRACT. In the paper contemporary approaches to argumentation are compared with a number of ways of understanding sophistic including ancient, medieval and contemporary 'faces' of the latter. It is argued that the current stage is characterized by a negative evaluative understanding of sophistic which is taken mostly as sophistry. In the paper, I also show how these different approaches to sophistic such as (1) illegitimate argumentation, (2) particular illegitimate arguments and (3) scholastic method of formulating and solving tasks grow out of its ancient and medieval historical forms, found in Aristotle, Plato, the Sophists and the Medieval thinkers. To illustrate this distinction I use a medieval sophism combined with a famous ancient anecdote. The distinction between three contemporary approaches which is set forward in the paper is based on semantic, procedural, pragmatic, communicative and speech-oriented criteria, and develops logical and cognitive approaches to argumentation.

VSEVOLOD LADOV
Tomsk State University, Tomsk Scientific Center SB RAS, Russia, ladov@yandex.ru
THE INFINITE LIAR
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 285–292
KEYWORDS: paradox, Liar, St. Paul, Diogenes Laertius, Epimenides, self-reference, hierarchical approach, Russell, Tarski, infinity, Yablo.
ABSTRACT. In this article I discuss the Liar Paradox and consider the history of the genesis of this semantic paradox in antiquity and the ways of overcoming of it in the 20th century. Special emphasis is placed on the contemporary discussions around the Liar Paradox. In particular, I analyze the Infinite Liar of Stephen Yablo. The specific characteristic of this version of

the paradox consists in the fact that it is not based on the phenomenon of self-reference. I discuss whether this version of paradox can be formulated in a finite number of steps of reasoning and conclude that infinity is an essential feature of this version of the Liar Paradox.

VITALY OGLEZNEV, ogleznev82@mail.ru
VALERY SUROVTSEV, surovtsev1964@mail.ru
Tomsk State University, Russia
RULES, LEGAL LANGUAGE, SPEECH ACTS
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 293–302
KEYWORDS: obligations in Roman law, H. L. A. Hart, J. L. Austin, legal language, legal rules, speech acts, imperative.
ABSTRACT. The article deals with the nature of legal rules. The authors argue that if all legal rules have obligative character, it means that they have the imperative nature. The article shows that the main feature of legal language is that for an explication of imperative character of legal rules is enough the fact of existence of this rule in particular legal system. Besides, an application of several points of the theory of speech acts to legal language allows showing that the question on what kind of linguistic form an imperative has (order, command, plea, etc.), doesn't matter, because this is always the legal rule.

VITALY OGLEZNEV
Tomsk State University, Tomsk State Polytechnic University ogleznev82@mail.ru
CONCEPTUAL ANALYSIS IN LEGAL PHILOSOPHY: THE LIMITS OF ITS APPLICATION
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 303–311
KEYWORDS: Plato, *Cratylus*, conceptual analysis, legal philosophy, methodology, legal language.
ABSTRACT. The paper presents a study of the place and importance of conceptual analysis in the methodological arsenal of analytical jurisprudence. It shows the historical importance and necessity of conceptual analysis in law, taking into account the specific features of this area of the humanities. Brain Leiter's arguments against an application of conceptual analysis in legal philosophy have been considered, as well as counter-arguments to naturalized jurisprudence. It has been shown that Leiter's claim to accept W. V. O. Quine's view that philosophy should abandon conceptual analysis for a scientific methodology does not work in legal philosophy.

METHODIUS ZINKOVSKI
The St. Cyril and Methodius' Post-Graduate and Doctoral programme
Moscow – Saint-Petersburg, m.zink@yandex.ru
THE TERM "PROAIRESIS" AND THE THEOLOGY OF PERSONALITY
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 312–327
KEYWORDS: Proairesis, gnome, freedom of choice, will, hypostasis, energy, mode of action.
ABSTRACT. The article is dedicated to the history of the development of the term «proairesis», which is directly linked to but not identical with the notion of will. When «proairesis» is considered in the framework of notions of the lack of knowledge and the possibility of sinful choice it cannot be attributed to God or to the saints. But in a wider perspective this term

reflects a subjective mode of the employment of the natural will and energy. «Proairesis» describes both a hypostatically determined direction of action and the state of nature of the willing personality. I give special attention to such features that form the notion of "proairesis", as its super-naturality, its synthetic character and intentionality.

VASILY GORAN
Institute of philosophy and law,
Novosibirsk State University, Russia, goran@philosophy.nsc.ru
LUCRETIUS CARUS: RATIONAL DETERMINISM VS IRRATIONAL INDETERMINISM
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 328–338
KEYWORDS: Epicureanism, materialism, free will, atoms, void, unpredictable swerve of atoms.
ABSTRACT. Rational determinism and irrational indeterminism meet in Lucretius' materialism for the first time in the history of western philosophy. Having postulated the concept of *clinamen*, an unpredictable swerve of atoms in indeterminate space, he in fact explains matter's ability to move by itself, which, in turn, creates fundamental ontological prerequisites for the concept of free will.

EVGENY BORISOV
Tomsk State University, Tomsk Scientific Center SB RAS, Russia, borisov.evgeny@gmail.com
BOETHIUS AND RYLE ON EPISTEMIC FATALISM
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 339–346
KEYWORDS: predestination, providence, eternity, temporality, truth, proposition.
ABSTRACT. Two ways of stating and solving the problem of epistemic fatalism elaborated by Boethius and G. Ryle are compared. It is argued that Boethius and Ryle state the problem in similar ways but the premises they use in solving it substantially differ. It is shown that the doctrine of eternity of God's knowledge plays a crucial role in the Boethian solution, while the Rylean solution, purified of theological premises, is based on the semantic idea that no proposition about a future object (an object that will exist in the future but does not exist presently) is possible.

ALEXANDER MAREY
The National Research University – Higher School of Economics,
Moscow, Russia, fijodalgo@gmail.com
THE KING, THE POPE AND THE EMPEROR: THE PROBLEM OF LEGITIMATION OF THE SECULAR POWER IN THE "SIETE PARTIDAS" AND THE GLOSS COMPOSED BY GREGORIO LOPEZ
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 347–364
KEYWORDS: Alphonse X the Wise; Siete Partidas; legitimacy of power; medieval law; Spanish medieval law; imperial power; Emperor of Holy Roman Empire; post-glossators; Charles V, emperor.
ABSTRACT. This article refers to conception of legitimacy of politic power in medieval Castile and later, in early modern Spanish Empire, reflected in the "Siete Partidas" of Alphonse the Sage, king of Castile and Leon (1252–1284) and in its gloss composed by Gr. Lopez – court lawyer and counsellor of the king Carlos I (the emperor Charles V in the case of Holy Roman Empire). Jurists of the 13th century construing the well-known legal maxim "Rex est impera-

tor in regno suo" (Decretals "Per venerabilem", 1205, by Pope Innocent III) insisted on the supremacy of royal power not only in relation to imperial but also to papal power. Thereby a king, according to jurists of Alphonse the Wise, was represented as supreme sovereign of his kingdom either in secular and spiritual affairs. In the 16th century the court lawyer of a Spanish emperor, Gregorio Lopez, emphasized the supremacy of imperial power in the secular affairs and papal – in the spiritual. Yet he marked the possibility for the emperor to be deposed by the Roman people, who gave him his power and, by means of the renovated social contract, could recall it.

Elena Marey
The National Research University – Higher School of Economics,
Moscow, Russia, elena.fontis@gmail.com
The concept of justice in the works of Isidore of Seville
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 365–377
Keywords: Isidore of Seville, *aequitas*, *iustitia*, human and divine justice, reception of the Roman legal tradition.
Abstract. The article is dedicated to the Latin concepts *aequitas* and *iustitia* in the works of Isidore of Seville. The "first Encyclopedic mind of the Middle Ages", Isidore was guided in his works (the "Etymologies", "Differences" and "Sentences", studied in this article) by the Roman legal tradition as well as the Christian tradition of use of these concepts. According to Isidore, justice (*iustitia*) is related to the written law (*ius*); this word is primarily used with reference to mundane justice and legislation. In the same time it may be a just legal order, established by God, and in this sense *iustitia* is partly associated with *aequitas*. On the contrary, an equity (*aequitas*) is based on natural law (*ius naturale*) and signifies the primordial order, natural and obvious to everyone. It's main feature is equality of all the people. Nevertheless (even in the same Isidore's works) the concepts of *aequitas* and *iustitia* look like interchangeable synonyms: the original distinction between them disappears little by little, as long as God is accepted to be an ultimate source for both *iustitia* and *aequitas* and a passage in the "Differences" I.32 (68) appears a mere scholastic exercise in distinguishing the concepts which no longer differ in practice.

Sergey Sannikov
Novosibirsk State University, sannikov_sv@yahoo.com
Semiosis of power in semantic type of culture: methodological prolegomena
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 378–398
Keywords: image of power, semiotics, culture, cultural code, medieval, signs of power, politics, semantic (symbolic) type of cultural code.
Abstract. The article presents analysis of the texts, functioning in the system of codes of culture, where the dominant role is played by semantic (symbolic) type of cultural code. The subject of research is the process of creation and functioning of signs of political power. Application of semiotic research methods allowed classifying symbolic power components in the semantic type of culture, revealing features of semiosis of the three main types of sign (symbols, indexes and icons), and considering of the semantic, syntactic and pragmatic dimensions of semiosis of power. Results of the study provide evidence to suggest that cultural

code that implies relation to a sign within a particular culture is immanent to a sign itself and can be regarded as a key component of the pragmatic dimension of semiosis.

Sergey Shevtsov
Odessa National University, Ukraine, sergiishevtsov@gmail.com
The term *Hybris* in Archaic Greece
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 399–417
Keywords: *hybris*, etymology, legal, archaic, poetry, culture, conduct.
Abstract. Do modern languages capture the true meaning of the Archaic Greek term *hybris*? Scholarly opinions vary a great deal and interpretations of the relevant texts (from Homer to Pindar) are still problematic. Based on the analysis provided, I offer a new hypothesis regarding the relation between the term and the first element in the binary opposition of nature / culture suggested by Claude Lévi-Strauss. To my mind the numerous meanings of *hybris* can be ultimately combined into the idea of "behavior related to nature and opposed to culture".

Anton Didikin
Institute of Philosophy and Law, Tomsk State University, Russia, abdidikin@bk.ru
Modern Natural Law Theories and the Classical Tradition
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 418–424
Keywords: classical theories of natural law and natural rights, analytical legal philosophy, legal rules, the concept of law, the common good, values, legal reality, legal epistemology, L.L. Fuller, J. Finnis.
Abstract. The paper attempts to analyze the historical aspects of the formation of some modern natural law theories in legal philosophy of the 20th century. It considers discussions between legal positivism and legal naturalism about the nature of law and the ways this discussion influenced modern legal philosophy. The conceptual grounds and methodology of legal theory is sketched against the background of the broader classical tradition extending from antiquity to early modernity. The author suggests a new approach to the historical research designed to analyze the development of modern legal ideas and natural law theories in legal philosophy.

Timothey Myakin
Novosibirsk State University, Russia, miackin.timof@yandex.ru
"Sappho is wise" or the Philosophy of Female Initiation
(the Sapphic "thiasos" in the light of the latest discoveries in papyrology and epigraphy)
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 425–444
Keywords: Sapphic's religious community, the initiation of girls, religion of the archaic Lesbos, cult of the goddess Cybele in the archaic Sicily, cult of the "Aeolean goddess" in archaic Lesbos, a Brothers poem of Sappho.
Abstract. The article exposes new arguments that support the views of Cl. Calame on the female circle of Sappho as a religious community confirmed historically. This community had been associated with the cult of the goddesses Artemis, Cybele and Aphrodite, who were responsible for soil fertility and reproductive health of women in ancient Lesbos. In one of

her songs (Fr. Sapph. 96, 5 Campbell) Sappho identifies the main occupation of the girls of her community as "song and dance" (μόλπα). Epigraphic evidence and the literary tradition allows us to associate this "song and dance" with the ritual singing and dancing of youth choirs, the associations of young men and women, and also – with the rituals of initiation. Thanks to Cretan parallels, the relationship that united Sappho and her girls can be seen as a relic of female initiation. These ceremonies are similar to those that characterized the relationship between men and boys in the Cretan "hetairia" (cf. IC III(II), №2, 2–3; Hom. Od. VI, 101–106; Hymn. Hom. in Merc. 451–452; Strab. X, 4, 20–21). A law of Cyrene (the 4th c. B.C.) also ordered that the bride entered the bridal chamber of Artemis before the wedding. And a Sapphic new song, which was discovered by D. Obbink, is a part of a longer composition, also written as a choral dialogue. This song says that girls of her community are ἀρτέμεας ("healthy, thanks to Artemis", cf. Plat. Crat., p. 406 b Steph.). The Sapphic choir ridicules brother of Sappho, and exposes this homosexual love of Sappho's girls (because this love is protected by Artemis) against the indiscriminate love of Charaxos. Consequently, Plato wrote, that Sappho is wise, for the reason that the poet defended these traditional rituals on a conservative manner.

Oleg Donskikh
Novosibirsk State University of Economics and Management,
Russia, olegdonskikh@yandex.ru
Philosophy as Literature: the forms of representations
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 445–453
Keywords: Ancient philosophy, Ancient literature, genres, Ionian project, philosophy and poetry.
Abstract. The article is devoted to the problem of literary design of the process of philosophizing, which is taking place simultaneously with the formation of prose, occurring in parallel with the development of poetic genres. The author substantiates the view that the representatives of the school of Miletus initially exchanged with speeches in quite narrow circle, while the Eleatics in their poems addressed to a wider range of participants. Thus the fact that the philosophy expresses itself in different genres – from speeches and letters to poems and aphorisms, shows that it has been developing, in its content, into a separate area of intellectual life, allowing Plato to talk about the opposition of poets and philosophers. However this approach ignores the fact that poets perform reflection on the problems, definitely related to the area of philosophy. Thus, the content of what was actually the sphere of philosophizing remains unclear and does not allow anyone to classify literary expression of philosophical discourse in the form of certain genres.

Roman Gromov
Southern Federal University (Rostov on Don), Russia, rgromov@yandex.ru
The Protestant and the Catholic branches of the Neo-aristotelianism in German philosophy of the 19th century. Franz Brentano on the several senses of Being in Aristotle
Language: Russian
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 454–472
Keywords: Aristotle, Neo-aristotelianism, Neo-scholasticism, Trendelenburg, F. Brentano, the doctrine of categories, metaphysics.

ABSTRACT. In the philosophical literature of the 19th century Neo-aristotelianism was considered to be an influential philosophical trend, which was initiated, first of all, by A. Trendelenburg and his disciples. A revival of the Aristotelian and Thomistic tradition in early German Neo-scholasticism of the 19th century can also be considered an important part of the Aristotelian renaissance of that period. In the article I attempt to differentiate the Protestant and the Catholic branches of the Neo-aristotelianism in German philosophy of the period in question on the basis of an analysis of the Aristotelian exegetics in the early works by F. Brentano, a disciple of Trendelenburg and an adherent of the Neo-scholastic movement.

EVGENY NAYMAN
Tomsk State University, enyman17@rambler.ru
ANCIENT MEDICAL SYMPTOMATOLOGY AND MODERN SEMIOTIC THEORY
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 473–479
KEYWORDS: medical semiotics, symptomatology, symptom, Hippocrates, Galen, sign.
ABSTRACT. This article focuses on the role of the medical semiotics of Hippocrates and Galen in the formation of Western semiotic theory. In ancient medical practice symptomatology was an essential part of semiotics, and the symptom was a model sign. But over time, the strong association of clinical and philosophical semiotics was destroyed. The article analyzes the causes of this historical gap and the marginalization of the symptom as a special type of sign, and identifies the philosophical questions of symptomatology: the relationship between the symptom and sign, the symptom and its denotation, and the subjective and the objective side of the symptom. The article demonstrates the relevance of symptomatology to the development of computer technology and artificial intelligence theory, and to the interpretation of disease in modern medicine. The author argues that currently there is a need for the reestablishment of semiology in the sphere from which it originated – the field of medical biology. The philosophy of medicine, psychology, biology, linguistics, communication theory and semiotics must rebuild the strong theoretical connection that flourished in the Greco-Roman era.

VASILY SYROV, narrat@inbox.ru
SOFYA SUKHANOVA, suhanova_sofya@mail.ru
Tomsk State University, Russia
THE CITY OF GOD AND THE MODERN PHILOSOPHY OF HISTORY: COULD AUGUSTINE'S REFLECTIONS ON HISTORY STILL TEACH US A LESSON?
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 480–491
KEYWORDS: teleology, providential idea, universal history, theory of progress, philosophy of history, historical experience.
ABSTRACT. The article discusses the role of the historical views of Augustine in contemporary historical thought. The object of analysis is his major work, *The City of God*. The main thesis is that Augustine's notion of history can be interpreted not only as a prerequisite for the formation of modern historical thought, but also as a source of its further development. The author's position is based on the trend in historiography asserting that Augustine has a critical attitude toward the historical views of the Christians and the pagans. An analysis of Augustine's statements in *The City of God* confirms his critical attitude toward any attempts to connect the date of the end of the world with the concrete events or to connect the direction of the course of the world history with the growth of Christian beliefs. Augustine's judgment

that the sense of calamities is equally applicable to the Christians and the pagans allows interpreting his view of the past not as a linear and continuous course, but as a series of historical experiences designed to test the strength of everyone's religious beliefs. Augustine's judgments about the inextricable mixing of the two cities and the wandering of the City of God allow interpreting the status of the idea of the City as a historical value that provides a choice of historical plots and types of historical narrative. This interpretation of Augustine's views leads to reconsidering of the conventional theses about the providentialism and teleology of his general religious concept. It is asserted that in Augustine, they characterize the general sense of worldly existence, but not the direction of the historical process. In conclusion we state that the interpretation of the past as a series of historical experiences basically corresponds with general orientations of the modern historical thought and correlates with the providential and teleological ideas of the general religious concept of Augustine.

VITALY TSELISHCHEV
Institute of philosophy and Law, Novosibirsk,
Tomsk State University, Russia, leitval@gmail.com
PLATONISM IN MATHEMATICS
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 492–504
KEYWORDS: Platonism, Frege, abstract objects, the existence, mathematical knowledge, epistemic access, reality, nominalism continuum hypothesis.
ABSTRACT. The article discusses the origin and justification of the term "mathematical Platonism" in the research program of the modern philosophy of mathematics, originated with Frege. It is shown that intuitive understanding of mathematical knowledge as a description of mathematical reality, independent of human consciousness, adopted by community of working mathematicians is consistent with a number of aspects of Plato's philosophy, in particular his concept of the existence of extrasensory world of ideal objects. I discuss various objections to mathematical Platonism, in particular nominalistic view of mathematics and the problem of epistemic access to abstract objects of mathematics. As a response to these objections I consider the radical kind of Platonism, the so-called "Full-blooded Platonism" that expands the existence of mathematical objects to potentially viable entities that largely change the original Frege's research program.

PAVEL BUTAKOV
Tomsk State University, Institute of Philosophy and Law,
Novosibirsk, pavelbutakov@academ.org
RELATIONS IN THE TRINITARIAN REALITY: TWO APPROACHES
LANGUAGE: English
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 505–519
KEYWORDS: Trinity, category of relation, Gregory of Nazianzus, Boethius, *filioque*, soteriology.
ABSTRACT. The Greek model of the Trinity, based on the *Theological Orations* of Gregory of Nazianzus, treats the Trinitarian relations as connections between the Father and the two other persons: the Son and the Holy Spirit. The two relations have to be heteronymous ("generation" and "procession"), and have to be interpreted from the extreme realistic position. The Latin Trinitarian model, based on Boethius' *De Trinitate*, treats relations as three subsistent persons. The relations have to be unidirectional: from the Father to the Son, and from both of them to the Holy Spirit. Both models are adequate and effective, but incompati-

ble. One of the consequences of this incompatibility is the problem of *filioque*: the introduction of an additional relation of procession into the Greek model as well as the exclusion of this relation from the Latin model result in the inadequacy of the models. From the point of view of the complementability of a model, the Greek model allows introduction of new elements, while the Latin model does not. The soteriological consequences are such that the Greek model welcomes a human person to establish a unique relation with the person of the Father, which leads to the *theosis* of a creature. The Latin model requires the saving relation to be established with the whole Trinity, and *theosis* is not supported.

MIKHAIL NEMTSEV
Novosibirsk State University of Economics and Management, nemtsev.m@gmail.com
VLADIMIR ERN READS PLATO: AN UNDERSTANDING OF THE CAVE
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 520–536
KEYWORDS: Vladimir Ern, Russian Platonism, "Phaedrus", *Parable of the Cave*, *heliolepsy*, Eros.
ABSTRACT. Vladimir Ern was one of the last pre-Revolution generation's philosophers who viewed Plato as an effective alternative to contemporary Western philosophy, and was among those who tried to reconstruct Plato's way of thinking in order to revolutionize philosophy. Ern produced his own interpretation of existential grounds of Plato's metaphysics, which he discovered in "Sun ekstasis" that presumably had happened to Plato as the ultimate final of his search for the Supreme Truth. Ern develops his perception through close reading of the *Parable of the Cave* in the *Republic* and the *Phaedrus*. He offers his reasons to choose these texts as bearers of a unique experience and strives to establish a new method of philosophizing as reproduction of Plato's way of philosophical Eros. In the article, Ern's reading of Plato's symbolic texts is being reconstructed and his project (unfortunately unfinished due to Ern's untimely death) is sketched in this essential features.

SERGEY AVANESOV
Tomsk State Pedagogical University, Tomsk State University, Russia, iskiteam@yandex.ru
PLATO'S *LYSIS*: AN ATTEMPT TO AN AXIOLOGICAL COMMENTARY
LANGUAGE: Russian
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 537–544
KEYWORDS: Ancient axiology, value, early terminology of values, Socratic dialogues.
ABSTRACT. This article continues the theme of Plato's axiology (ΣΧΟΛΗ [Schole] 2.2 and 7.2). The author analyzes the dialogue "Lysis" in order explore the origins of philosophical doctrine of valuable in ancient intellectual tradition. The essence of friendship is discussed in this dialogue. Socrates concludes that friendship is irrelevant to the good or to the bad. Friendship occurs only in the sphere of the "third" – neither good nor bad. Static nature of the "goodness" in itself and dynamic state of "neither goodness nor evil" are the bases of practical conclusion about the communicative axiological nature of "intermediate". Understanding of friendship is further based on this conclusion. Theoretical operation which allows distinguishing values according to their statuses is applied in the dialogue to individual "preferences". Plato's "Lysis" therefore represents one of the first and most important steps towards the gradual formation of the European philosophical axiology.

IGOR R. TANTLEVSKIJ
St. Petersburg State University, Russia, tantigor@mail.wplus.net
ETYMOLOGY OF THE NICKNAME *'ISKARIŌT(H)*:
the "One Who Saw a Sign" [('i)sqar(î)'ôṯ/yisqar(î)'ôṯ] or the "One Who Slandered/Betrayed a Sign" [('i)šqar(î)'ôṯ/yišqar(î)'ôṯ]?
LANGUAGE: English
ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.2 (2014) 545–548
KEYWORDS: The Gospels; etymology of Judas's nickname *Iskariot(h)*.
ABSTRACT. The article derives Judas's nickname *'Iskariṓt(h)* from the Hebrew/Aramaic verb *sāqar/s^{e}qar*, and the noun *'ōṯ/'ôṯ* (widely used in Biblical Hebrew and attested in the Talmud [=Aramaic *'t/'t'*]), and interprets it as the "one who saw/gaze upon a sign" (cf., *e.g.*, *John* 2:23, 4:48, 6:2,14,30 mentioning those who «saw signs» and came to be Jesus's followers; the verbs *theōréō* and *'oráō* used in these passages correlate with the verb *sāqar/s^{e}qar*, "to look (at), gaze, see", and the noun *sēmeîon* (pl. *sēmeîa*) correlates with the term *'ōṯ/'ôṯ*, "sign"). The *ex hypothesi* "positive" character of Judas's nickname possibly explains the evangelists' renunciation of its interpretation. As an alternative etymology of Judas's nickname *'Iskariṓt(h),* one can derive it from the Hebrew/Aramaic verb *šāqar/š^{e}qar* ("to lie, deceive, slander", *sc.* "to violate (a treaty, etc.)", "to betray" [the latter meaning is attested in Samaritan Aramaic]) and the same noun *'ōṯ/'ôṯ*: the "one who slandered/*resp.* betrayed a sign", *i.e.* the one who brought false evidence against Jesus (cf.: *Matt.* 26:59 ff.; *Mk.* 14:55 ff.). In *Jn.* 6:70, Jesus himself defines Judas with the term *diábolos*; this word can be interpreted as "slanderer", "accuser".

ΣΧΟΛΗ (Schole)
ФИЛОСОФСКОЕ АНТИКОВЕДЕНИЕ И КЛАССИЧЕСКАЯ ТРАДИЦИЯ
2014. Том 8. Выпуск 2

ВЫБОР • ПРАВО • ВЛАСТЬ • АРГУМЕНТ

Научное редактирование Е. В. Афонасина

Новосибирск: Ред.-изд. центр Новосиб. гос. ун-та, 2014. 448 с.
ISSN 1995-4328 (Print) ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

В основной своей части выпуск включает материалы междисциплинарного проекта по истории и философии права. Кроме того, в выпуске публикуются ряд переводов, статей и рецензий по антиковедению.

Журнал индексируется The Philosopher's Index и SCOPUS и доступен в электронном виде на собственной странице www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/, а также в составе следующих электронных библиотек: www.elibrary.ru (Научная электронная библиотека) и www.ceeol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).

ΣΧΟΛΗ (Schole)
ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION
2014. Volume 8. Issue 2

CHOICE • LAW • POWER • ARGUMENT

Edited by Eugene V. Afonasin
Novosibirsk: State University Press, 2014. 448 p.
ISSN 1995-4328 (Print) ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

The central part of the issue consists of the articles, prepared in the framework of an interdisciplinary project in the history and philosophy of law. Supplementary materials include translations, articles, and reviews in various areas of the classical studies.

The journal is abstracted / indexed in The Philosopher's Index and SCOPUS and available on-line at the following addresses: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/ (journal's home page) and www.ceeol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).

Компьютерная верстка и корректура Е. В. Афонасина
Подписано в печать 28.06.2014. Заказ №
Формат 70 x 108 1/16.
Редакционно-издательский центр НГУ,
630090, Новосибирск-90, ул. Пирогова, 2