ΣΧΟΛΗ (Schole)

ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

Editor-in-Chief
Eugene V. Afonasin (Novosibirsk)

Executive Secretary
Anna S. Afonasina (Novosibirsk)

Reviews and Bibliography
Michael V. Egorochkin (Moscow)

Editorial Board
Igor V. Berestov (Novosibirsk), Pavel A. Butakov (Novosibirsk),
John Dillon (Dublin), Svetlana V. Mesyats (Moscow), Dominic O’Meara (Friburg),
Eugene V. Orlov (Novosibirsk), Vadim B. Prozorov (Moscow), Andrei I. Schetnikov
(Novosibirsk), Teun Tieleman (Utrecht), Marina N. Wolf (Novosibirsk)

Advisory Committee
Sergey S. Avanesov (Tomsk), Leonidas Bargeliotes (Athens–Ancient Olympia), Luc
Brisson (Paris), Levan Gigineishvili (Tbilisi), Vasily P. Goran (Novosibirsk),
Vladimir S. Diev (Novosibirsk), Sergey P. Shevtsov (Odessa), Vitaly V. Tselitschev
(Novosibirsk), Alexey V. Tzyb (St. Petersburg)

Established at
Novosibirsk State University
Institute of Philosophy and Law (Novosibirsk, Russia)

The journal is published twice a year since March 2007

The address for correspondence
Philosophy Department, Novosibirsk State University,
Pirogov Street, 2, Novosibirsk, 630090, Russia

E-mail addresses:
Articles and translations: afonasin@gmail.com
Reviews and bibliography: egorochkin@torba.com

On-line version: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/

© Aquilo Press, 2015
ISSN 1995-4328 (Print) © The Center for Ancient Philosophy and
ISSN 1995-4336 (Online) the Classical Tradition, 2007–2015
Содержание / Contents

С аналитической точки зрения: право и философия
From the analytical point of view: Law and Philosophy

Справедливость в современной социально-философской теории:
как работает аристotelевская идея правосудности?
211
В. В. Петренко, И. А. Эннс

«Гераклит» Хайдеггера, aletheia и парадокс лжеца
221
В. А. Ладов

Определение per genus proximum et differentiam specificam
и юридический язык
228
В. В. Оглезнев, В. А. Суровцев

О соотношении категорий to lekton в философии стоиков и Sinn в
семантической теории Г. Фреге
241
В. А. Суровцев

Две интерпретации проблемы логического детерминизма
у Аристотеля
253
Е. В. Борисов

Истинностное значение высказываний о будущих единичных
событиях у Аристотеля
260
Е. И. Спешилова

Философия права Ганса Кельзена: релятивизм и переосмысление
причинности
265
А. Б. Дидикин

Varia

Статьи / Articles

Consciousness of Self, of Time and of Death in Greek Philosophy: Some
Reflections
283
Dominic O’Meara

Визуально-антропологические коннотации в онтологии Парменида
292
С. С. Аванесов

Макробий Комментарий на «Сон Сципиона» и релевантные
контексты
306
М. С. Петрова

Макробий. Комментарий на «Сон Сципиона» I 8 (О добродетелях)
312
М. С. Петрова, перевод, примечания

Образ сoterологической фигуры «подобного сыну человеческому» в
иудейской литературе эпохи эллинизма и его возможный прототип в
псалме 110[109]
316
И. Р. Тантглевский

ΣΧΟΛΗ Vol. 9, 2 (2015)
www.nsu.ru/classics/schole
210 Содержание / Contents

Древнегреческая трагедия как источник спекулятивного мышления 331
Е. А. НАЙМАН

Арианские споры второй половины IV в.: начало полемики об универсалиях в византийской богословско-философской мысли и его контекст (1) 339
Д. С. БИРЮКОВ

Тетраграмматон и концепция божественной субстанции в «Исповеди», кн. VII Августина и в учении Спинозы 350
И. Р. ТАНГЛЕВСКИЙ

Эмпедокл о дыхании 353
А. С. АФОНАСИНА

Состояния и отношения у Григория Назианзина 363
П. А. БУТАКОВ

*Hybris* как инверсия «объекта» и «метода» в «Пире» Платона 373
И. А. ПРОТОПОПОВА

Эпистемология versus онтология в античной философии математики 380
В. В. ЦЕЛИЩЕВ

Аристотель и Александр Афродисийский о росте и растущем 394
В. В. ПЕТРОВ

РЕЦЕНЗИИ И БИБЛИОГРАФИЯ / REVIEWS AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

«Философия Плотина» Эмиля Брейе в контексте дискуссий о мышлении Ума 404
И. В. БЕРЕСТОВ

Достижима ли цель философского поиска? Обзор книги К. Альберта «О понятии философии у Платона» 425
Н. П. ВОЛКОВА

Когда мораль в согласии с природой. Рецензия на книгу П. А. Гаджикурбановой «Этика Ранней Стои: учение о должном» 436
А. А. САНЖЕНАКОВ

Origen in Russian Philosophy
ALEXEY KAMENSKIKH 447

Хинтикка о сократической эпистемологии 461
В. В. ЦЕЛИЩЕВ

НАУЧНАЯ ЖИЗНЬ / EVENTS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Двойной юбилей / Double anniversary 465

АННОТАЦИИ / ABSTRACTS 468
ABSTRACTS

VALERIA PETRENKO AND IRINA ENNS
Tomsk State University, Russia, vptomsk@mail.ru; irnss609@yandex.ru
JUSTICE IN MODERN SOCIAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL THEORY:
HOW ARISTOTLE’S IDEA OF JUSTICE WORKS?
Language: Russian
Keywords: The idea of justice, Aristotle, J. Rawls, P. Ricoeur, hermeneutics, philosophical liberalism, pragmatics.
Abstract. The article presents the contemporary socio-philosophical edition of “justice” as the reception of Aristotelian ideas of the purposeful and equal distribution. Ways of a tematization of the “justice” in liberal-philosophical and hermeneutical tradition are analysed on the example of John Rawls and Riker’s positions. The methodological bases of the analysis and representation of this phenomenon are noted as continuations of logic of ancient topics of “justice”. The discourse of justice serves as an area of categorization of duties and obligations, and the sphere of social pragmatics. The authors believe that the specifics of the position proposed by J. Rawls is that his theory of justice is an attempt of transcendental foundation of sociality. The transcendental apriori in Paul Ricoeur’s hermeneutics works differently. He postulates the importance of a peaceful life measurement. In the transcendental dimension justice perceives the source of moral prescriptions in the idea of the Other and manifest itself as an intentional object. In the domain of law justice corresponds to legal prescriptions and application of the rights makes “justice” – in the spirit of Aristotle – the predicate of a specific legal decision.

VSEVOLOD LADOV
Tomsk State University, Tomsk Scientific Center SB RAS, Russia, ladov@yandex.ru
HEIDEGGER’S «HERAKLIT», ALETHEIA, AND THE LIAR PARADOX
Language: Russian
Keywords: aletheia, truth, Die Unverborgenheit, un-concealed, the Liar Paradox, Heidegger, Heraclitus.
Abstract. In this article I analyze Heidegger’s interpretation of the Greek word «aletheia» (truth) from a logical point of view. Heidegger asserts that Greek philosophers considered «aletheia» to be «Die Unverborgenheit» (an un-concealed). How the Liar Paradox will look like if we use Heidegger’s «Die Unverborgenheit» instead of «truth» in the logical reasoning? I assert that if Heidegger’s concept of truth is utilized a clear logical formulation of the Liar Paradox will be impossible. This fact casts doubt on Heidegger’s interpretation of the Greek idea of «aletheia», because the Liar Paradox is one of the oldest paradoxes formulated in Greek philosophy.
VITALY OGLEZNEV
Tomsk Polytechnic University, Tomsk State University, ogleznev82@mail.ru

VALERY Surovtsev
Tomsk State University, surovtsev1964@mail.ru

**DEFINITION PER GENUS PROXIMUM ET DIFFERENTIAM SPECIFICAM AND LEGAL LANGUAGE**

*Language: Russian*

*Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 9.2 (2015) 228–240*

*Keywords: Aristotle, Porphyry, Boethius, definitio per genus proximum et differentiam specificam, legal language, H. L. A. Hart, J. Bentham.*

**Abstract:** This essay is concerned with the applicability in modern conceptual jurisprudence of a particular methodology for defining concepts, namely, *definitio per genus proximum et differentiam specificam*. We explicate the origin of this method and how it was applied by Aristotle, Porphyry, and Boethius, arguing that H. L. A. Hart’s views about the “open texture” of language, which is context-sensitive, call into question the applicability of this methodology in modern conceptual jurisprudence.

VALERY Surovtsev
Tomsk State University, Russia, surovtsev1964@mail.ru

**TO LEKTON IN STOIC PHILOSOPHY AND Sinnen IN G. Freges SEMANTIC THEORY: THE QUESTION OF THEIR RELATIONSHIP**

*Language: Russian*


*Keywords: Stoic logic, to lekton, G. Frege, Sinn, semantic theory, axiōma, Gedanke, comparative studies, ancient and contemporary logic, B. Mates.*

**Abstract.** The article deals with the Stoic category *to lekton* and G. Frege’s category of *Sinnen*. I explicate some formal features of these categories, which demonstrate the similarity of the Stoic and the Fregean logical theories, and develop some ideas related to this matter, previously expressed by B. Mates (1961). In particular, I demonstrate that the concept of “complete lekton” (axiōma) in the Stoic doctrine has the same structure as the concept of thought (*Gedanke*) in Frege’s semantic theory. However, the formal structural similarity between *to lekton* and *Sinnen* does not presupposes the ontological, epistemological and logical doctrinal similarities in these theories.

EVENY BORISOV
Tomsk State University, Tomsk Scientific Center SB RAS, borisov.evgeny@gmail.com

**TWO INTERPRETATIONS OF THE PROBLEM OF LOGICAL DETERMINISM IN ARISTOTLE**

*Language: Russian*


*Keywords: logical determinism, truth, bivalence, diachronic modality, Aristotle, Łukasiewicz, von Wright.*

**Abstract.** In *De Interpretatione* 9 (19a7–19b4), Aristotle discusses the problem of the logical determinism. In analytic philosophy, this fragment is interpreted by means of the modern logic. There are, basically, two approaches in interpreting it. Proponents of one of them claim that Aristotle’s discussion of the problem ends in restricting the principle of bivalence. Proponents of another one argue that Aristotle intends to show that the deterministic argument is not valid and does not demand any revision of logical principles. Interpretations by Łukasiewicz and von Wright, representing these approaches, are analyzed in the present pa-
The main differences between Łukasiewicz’s and von Wright’s ways of exposing and rebutting the deterministic argument are explicated. Using an argument of Fine, it is shown that von Wright’s interpretation is preferable.

ELIZAVETA SPESHIMOVA
Tomsk State University, Russia, e.speshilova@yandex.ru
THE TRUTH-VALUE OF FUTURE CONTINGENT PROPOSITIONS IN ARISTOTLE
Language: Russian
Keywords: Aristotle, law of contradiction, law of excluded middle, future contingents, sea-battle, truth, necessity, epistemic fatalism.
Abstract. The article deals with the problem of future contingents in Aristotle. According to Aristotle, clarification of «conclusion’s principles» is included in the subject of philosophy along with the study of being as such. The law of contradiction and the law of the excluded middle are reliable and unconditional principles of conclusion. However, the example with the statements about future events either calls into question the universality of these «conclusion’s principles» or leads to «epistemic fatalism». The author analyzes the original formulation and the solution of this problem in chapter 9 of the treatise of Aristotle «On interpretation».

ANTON DIDIKIN
Tomsk State University, Institute of Philosophy and Law, Russia, abdidikin@bk.ru
LEGAL PHILOSOPHY OF HANS KELSEN: RELATIVISM AND CAUSALITY RETHought
Language: Russian
Keywords: normativity, being, obligation, basic norm, causality, imputation, absolutism, relativism, Heraclitus fr. 94 DK.
Abstract. The paper attempts to analyze the historical, philosophical and methodological aspects of the philosophical and legal views of Hans Kelsen as interpreted from the point of view of the ‘classical’ theories of natural law, obligations and justice. The author outlines the main concepts and categories of normativity in the context of the principle of relativism and discusses some features and applications of the principle of relativism in the cognition of legal reality, and reconsideration of causality in the legal field. Attached is a translation of Kelsen’s important article “Causality and Imputation” (1950).

DOMINIC O’MEARA
Fribourg University, Switzerland, dominic.omeara@unifr.ch
CONSCIOUSNESS OF SELF, OF TIME AND OF DEATH IN GREEK PHILOSOPHY: SOME REFLECTIONS
Language: English
Keywords: ancient philosophy, psychology, temporality, self-awareness, death.
Abstract. In this paper, I do not propose to discuss the ways of thinking about and coming to terms with our awareness of our coming death. I would like rather to discuss a more particular and perhaps unusual problem, that of the relation between our awareness of our death and our consciousness of ourselves. In the following I take four examples: Parmenides, Plato, Epicurus and Plotinus. I sketch the different ways in which these philosophers saw the relation between self-consciousness and death, how they tried to dissipate what seemed to them
to be a tension, even a contradiction, between these two parts of our existence. My discussion does not seek to contribute to the philological analysis of specific ancient texts, but proposes rather an attempt to reach an overall view, which might be of a broader interest.

SERGEY AVANESOV
Tomsk State Pedagogical University, iskiteam@yandex.ru

VISUAL ANTHROPOLOGICAL CONNOTATIONS IN PARMENIDES’ ONTOLOGY (1)
Language: Russian
Keywords: ancient philosophy, pre-Socratics, Parmenides, ontology, anthropology, visual experience.

Abstract. The author analyzes the text of the Parmenides’ poem. He aims to explicate the ideas that express the views of this ancient philosopher on the ontological parameters of human existence and accentuates “optical” characteristics of Parmenides philosophical language. These characteristics express the key problem points in the process of understanding the mutual relations of sensually empirical evidence and theoretical scientific knowledge, of explicit “many things” and implicit “single”, of the physical dynamics and speculative statics, of “human” world and the “true” being. Having reviewed comprehensively and critically the situation of the subject of ontological discourse, described by Parmenides, I determine the original contexts of the philosopher’s speech about things. The prevailing context of the speech of Parmenides is a religious mythical (or mystical visionary) context, which determines not only the plot and content of the philosopher’s text, but also its genre forms. At the same time I note the presence of an implicit realistic (literal) meaning of the poem, refers to the particular biography of Parmenides. It is my hope to demonstrate the relevance of Parmenides thought for the modern philosophical understanding of the essence of human being.

MAYA PETROVA
Institute of history, Moscow, Russia, beionyt@mail.ru

Macrobius’ Commentary on the ‘Dream of Scipio’ and its Relevant Contexts
Language: Russian
Keywords: method, fragment, intellectual tradition, commentary, source.

Abstract. The paper attempts to show how it is possible to interpret natural-philosophical, psychological and ethical fragments from Macrobius’ Commentary on the ‘Dream of Scipio’ (the 5th c.) by means of the method of relevant contexts. To this end, Hierocles of Alexandria’ Commentary on the Golden Verses of Pythagoras is discussed.

IGOR R. TANTLEVSKIJ
St. Petersburg State University, Russia, tantigor@mail.wplus.net

IMAGES OF THE SOTERILOGICAL FIGURE OF "ONE LIKE A SON OF MAN" IN JEWISH LITERATURE OF THE HELLENISTIC PERIOD AND ITS POSSIBLE PROTOTYPE IN PSALM 110
Language: Russian
Keywords: “One Like a Son of Man”; Dan. 7:13–14; Ps. 110; the “Old Greek Translation” of the Dan. 7:13–14 passage, and Jn. 14:9–11; Rev. 1:13–14, 3:21; 4Q246=4Q psDan4; 4Q491c, fr. 1; the ‘Exagōgê’, 68–82 by Ezekiel the Tragedian; “Orphica”.

"Abstracts / ΣΧΟΛΗ Vol. 9. 2 (2015)"
Abstract. The author tries to reveal Biblical sources of the image of “One Like a Son of Man” in Dan. 7:13–14, including the “Old Greek Translation” of this passage, as well as to reveal certain parallels to this figure in Jewish literature of the Hellenistic period and in the New Testament. At this, special attention is given to the interpretation of Psalm 110. Considering Jewish texts of the epoch of Hellenism, the author dwells specially on the analysis of the Apocryphon of Daniel (4Q246=4Q psDan²), the Qumran “Self-glorification Hymn” (4Q491†, fr. 1), and the fragment of the Ἐξαγωγή, 68–82 by Ezekiel the Tragedian.

EVTGENY NAYMAN
Tomsk State University, Tomsk Scientific Center SB RAS, enyman17@rambler.ru

ANCIENT GREEK TRAGEDY AS AN ORIGIN OF SPECULATIVE THOUGHT
Language: Russian
Keywords: ancient Greek tragedy, mimesis, catharsis, speculative thought, dialectics, “philosophical tragedy”, Aristotle, Schelling, Hegel.

Abstract. This article focuses on the role of the ancient Greek tragedy in the formation of a speculative philosophy. The author argues that the tragedy model is a prototype for the Schelling’s and Hegel’s speculative metaphysics. Its dialectical structure acts as the general means of resolving the philosophical contradictions between dogmatism and criticism, freedom and necessity, the subjective and the objective. The speculative system restored the identity of freedom and necessity through conflict. The comparative analysis of the idealistic “philosophical tragedy” and ancient Greek tragedy revealed their deep internal relationship. Based on Szondi, Lacoue-Labarthe and Bataille, the author argues that the speculative tragedy, based on the principles of Aristotle’s theory of catharsis, and the mimetic nature of dialectical thinking are closely linked with the poetics of the tragic action, recreating the ritual forms of sacrifice.

DMITRY BIRYUKOV
National Research Nuclear University MEPhI, Saint Petersburg State University of Aerospace Instrumentation, Padova University, dbirjuk@gmail.com

PART I. THE TOPIC OF UNIVERSALS IN THE ARIAN CONTROVERSY OF THE SECOND HALF OF THE FOURTH CENTURY AND ITS HISTORICAL CONTEXT
Language: Russian
Keywords: universals, patristic philosophy, hierarchy of natural beings, genera-species dividing, consubstantiality, the Arian debates.

Abstract. The doctrine of consubstantiality from Basil of Caesarea’s “Against Eunomius”, written as a reaction to the Apology of Eunomius originated a controversy over universals in the second half of the fourth century. This doctrine implies understanding of consubstantiality in the “horizontal” sense as commonness between the Persons of the Trinity, the same way as species are common to the constituent individuals. Using the fragments of Eunomius’ reply to the conception of Basil in Apology for Apology, preserved in Gregory of Nyssa, I demonstrate that in his attempt to refute the applicability of the notion of consubstantiality to God the Father and the Son, Eunomius elaborated his own doctrine of commonness: the
higher we go up the hierarchy of beings, the lesser the horizontal commonness in the nature of individual beings we see.

IGOR R. TANTLEVSKIJ
St. Petersburg State University, Russia, tantigor@mail.wplus.net
TETRAGRAMMATON AND CONCEPTION OF SINGLE GOD’S SUBSTANIA IN AUGUSTINE’S “CONFESSIONS”, BOOK VII AND IN SPINOZA’S TEACHING
Language: Russian
Keywords: Tetragrammaton, Ex. 3:14, Acts 17:28, Substantia, Augustine, Spinoza.
Abstract. The Author supposes that the Tetragrammaton’s interpretation, attested in Ex. 3:14, exerted direct influence on the formation of the conception of single, eternal, and infinite God’s substantia, reflected in Augustine’s “Confessions”, book VII and in Spinoza’s teaching.

ANNA AFONASINA
Tomsk State Pedagogical University, Novosibirsk State University, afonasina@gmail.com
EMPEDOCELLES ON BREATHING
Language: Russian
Keywords: clepsydra, breathing, Aristotle, the effect of simile.
Abstract. In Fr. B 100 DK Empedocles famously compares the principle of breathing with this of clepsydra. This simile provoked a scholarly controversy. The main question is what kind of breathing Empedocles describes – the breathing through the skin or the breathing through the mouth and nostrils? In this article I consider various solutions to the problem, suggested by different scholars (Powell 1923, Last 1924, Furley 1957, Booth 1960, Bollack 1965, O’Brien 1970), and incline to accept the idea that Empedocles describes a form of breathing through the skin with a qualification that the skin in question is the outer membrane of the respiratory apparatus rather than the outer covering of the living body, as it was previously thought. This article is the first part of the future analysis of Empedocles’ views on physical mechanisms of living beings and their sense perceptions.

PAVEL BUTAKOV
Tomsk State University,
Institute of Philosophy and Law, Novosibirsk, Russia, pavelbutakov@academ.org
DISPOSITIONS AND RELATIONS IN GREGORY NAZIANZEN
Language: Russian
Keywords: Gregory Nazianzen, Trinity, category of relation, Stoic categories, schesis.
Abstract. The Greek word ‘schesis’ in the works of Gregory Nazianzen has generally been translated as ‘relation’ and interpreted as a programmatic term for his doctrine of Trinitarian relations. Although this may be a valid interpretation of the terminology of other 4th century theologians, this is not true of Gregory. His usage of the word ‘schesis’ does not correspond with the traditional Aristotelian or Stoic ways of designating a relation. It denotes a status or a disposition, it may even mean a place in a relation, but it is not the relation itself, and not a disposition towards another. Therefore all the interpretations of Gregory’s teaching on the
Trinitarian relations are to be revisited and reformulated more carefully, keeping in mind the peculiarity of his usage of ‘schesis.’

IRINA PROTOPOPOVA  
Russian State University for the Humanities, Moscow, plotinus70@gmail.com  
HYBRS AS INVERSION OF "OBJECT" AND "METHOD" IN PLATO’S SYMPOSIUM  
Language: Russian  
Keywords: Plato, Symposium, hybris, inversion, mystery, androgyne.  
Abstract. The paper aims to examine the semantics of hybris as “inversion” as one of the leitmotifs of the Symposium relating to the topic of interacting opposites. This theme unfolds throughout the dialogue at the level of the vocabulary, the characters’ behavior, the philosophical content and the structure of the dialogue. The analysis of these levels of the text is implemented by means of the key metaphors of inversion and hybris in the Symposium – androgynes of Aristophanes and silenes from the speech of Alcibiades. The author concludes that the Symposium may be called, overall, a philosophical apology of hybris as inversion of “object” and “method” in the form of a sui generis “satyric drama”.

VITALY TSELYSHCHEV  
Novosibirsk State University, Institute of Philosophy and Law, Novosibirsk, Russia, leitval@gmail.com  
EPISTEMOLOGY VS ONTOLOGY IN ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY OF MATHEMATICS  
Language: Russian  
Keywords: Plato, Aristotle, mathematical object, mathematical truth, epistemology, ontology.  
Abstract. This article discusses two alternative concepts of the philosophy of mathematics in ancient philosophy, associated with Plato and Aristotle. The dominant theme in Plato ontological understanding of the eternal nature of mathematical objects is rejected by Aristotle in favor of epistemological procedures in the practice of geometric mathematical proof.

VALERY V. PETROFF  
Institute of Philosophy of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow, vpetroff@gmail.com  
ARISTOTLE AND ALEXANDER OF APHRODISIAS ON GROWTH AND GROWING  
Language: Russian  
Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 9.2 (2015) 394–403  
Keywords: Aristotle, Alexander of Aphrodisias, growth, change, generation, form (eidos), identity, De generatione et corruptione.  
Abstract. The article investigates the tradition of discussions focusing on growth and growing started by Aristotle and continued by Alexander of Aphrodisias, including the polemics concerning the identity of individual’s changing body. It is shown that the questions of individual identity discussed already by Epicharmus and Plato, are treated in Aristotle in terms of the phenomenon of growth. In the De generatione et corruptione Aristotle argues that growth, being quantitative change, differs from the coming-to-be and qualitative alteration. What retains in the changing body is its eidos, which is compared with elastic pipe (aulos) imposing form on the water flowing through it. The related arguments from Alexander of Aphrodisias’ discussions of growth and growing are under consideration. According to Alexander, eidos, as an unchangeable nature (due to the fact that it preserves its identity) may be subject of
accidental changes (in this case, it varies in size). The author indicates relevant doctrinal and terminological parallels between Aristotle and Alexander.

IGOR BERESTOV
Tomsk State University, Institute of Philosophy and Law, Novosibirsk, Russia, berestoviv@yandex.ru

“THE PHILOSOPHY OF PLOTINUS” BY ÉMILE BRÉHIER IN THE CONTEXT OF THE DISCUSSIONS ON NOUS’ THINKING.
Language: Russian
Keywords: Plotinus, Mind, object of thinking, intellectualism, non-discursive thinking.
Abstract: The article offers a critical analysis of the famous studies by Émile Bréhier of the philosophy of Plotinus. His book, published in French in 1928 and a series of later articles, along with two Wayne Hankey’s studies on Bréhier are now translated into Russian for the first time. I present an overview of A. S. Gagonin’s preface to the book and outline the content of the book chapter after chapter. I find it important to indicate the target audience of the book and the aspects in which it can still be useful to modern readers. Then I try to provide a critical analysis of Bréhier’s interpretation of Plotinus’ doctrine of Nous. Based on some modern Anglo-American studies of Plotinus’ philosophy I demonstrate that Bréhier’s evaluation of Plotinus’ doctrine of Nous, as “lifeless” and “heterogeneous” is too hasty. Similarly his still influential statement that the doctrine of Nous in Plotinus is confused with the doctrine of the One, and consequently not rooted in the genuine context of the Greek philosophy, can also be evaluated as a hasty judgment.

NADEZHDA VOLKHOVA
Institute of Philosophy RAS, Moscow, Russia, go2nadya@gmail.com
Is the Goal of Philosophical Enquiry Achievable?
A Review of Karl Albert, On the Meaning of the Philosophy according to Plato.
Language: Russian
Keywords: philosophy, theory of ideas, the Tübingen School, Plato, Plotinus, Nietzsche.
Abstract: This review focuses on the book by K. Albert On the Meaning of the Philosophy according to Plato (1989). The title of this book reflects its main theme. What is Philosophy according to Plato? What is the object of it? Where does it take its origin and where is the end of philosophical path? This is the range of questions that are answered by the author. The purpose of his study, which was successfully achieved, is to clarify the meaning of Plato’s philosophy. K. Albert argues that according to Plato philosophy is not an infinite and fundamentally unsatisfied desire. At the final stage of philosophical path philosopher find him- or herself in a completely new realm of being, which is described by Plato as a divine and immortal area. The author concludes that the path of philosophy comes from the multiplicity to a certain limit, to the ultimate knowledge of the One. The author refers to the study of K. Gaiser and H. Krämer, to whom he dedicated his book. K. Gaiser and H. Krämer
are the founders of the so-called Tübingen school, the main premise of which was a desire to reconstruct Plato's philosophy as a single metaphysical system. K. Albert refers to that interpretation of the theory of ideas, from which follows that Plato is not talking about two stages of knowledge – things and ideas, but about three stages – things, ideas, and the One. Then the One, according to K. Albert corresponds to three higher ideas – these of Good, Beauty and Being. Interpreting Plato in this way he brings him closer to the Neoplatonists, such as Plotinus.

ALEXANDER SANZHENAKOV
Institute of Philosophy and Law, Russia, Novosibirsk, sanzhenakov@gmail.com

WHEN MORALITY IS IN ACCORDANCE WITH NATURE.

Abstract. The monograph under review investigates the correlation of the two Stoic ethical concepts: *kathēkon* (appropriate action) and *katorthōma* (perfect moral action). As the author highlights, specific features of the Stoic ethical theory are focused in these concepts and the character of their relations, and at the same time its key challenges are associated with them: the correlation of the highest good and the relative values, and the correlation of natural and virtuous. The author presents readers a history of the investigated problem in the introduction. The first chapter is devoted to the study of the main provisions of the ethics of early Stoics, aretology and axiology of Stoics, doctrine of *oikeiōsis* etc. The second chapter deals with the problem of influence of Cynic and Peripatetic philosophy on ethics of Stoa. The third chapter is devoted to the solution of the main objective of this work. In order to achieve this goal the author uses the rich heritage of research, which includes names such as M. Forschner, G. Nebel, J. Rist, D. Tsekourakis, A. Huseynov, A. Stolyarov and others. The following position can be assumed as the basic setting of the author: *kathēkon* and *katorthōma* are related as matter (*hylē*) and principle (*arkhē*) of the act. On the one hand, this thesis captures the qualitative difference between the two spheres of Stoic ethics. On the other hand, the author fairly insists that the two areas are closely connected to each other. To sum up, the principle is independent from the matter, but the first cannot be completely isolated from the second.

ALEXEY KAMENSKIKIN
National Research University – the Higher School of Economics, Perm, kamen7@mail.ru

ORIGEN IN RUSSIAN PHILOSOPHY

Abstract. Observing the history of reception of Origen's intellectual heritage by Russian theologians and philosophers of the past few centuries, some key moments and figures are discernible. Those figures are Grigory Skovoroda (1722–1794), Vladimir Solovyov, Sergei Bulgakov, Nicolay Berdiaev, George Florovsky.

Keywords: Origen of Alexandria, apocatastasis, Biblical allegorism, Russian religious philosophy, Grigory Skovoroda, Vladimir Solovyov, Sergei Bulgakov, Nicolay Berdiaev, George Florovsky.
1979). Those authors’ significance for our outline is determined by (1) their key role in the evolution of Russian theological and philosophical thought and – at the same time – (2) by the fact that those authors’ own intellectual evolution and/or (3) their ideas’ reception by their contemporaries proceeded in close connection with the problem of Origen. So the process of reception of Origen’s intellectual heritage in Russia was substantially conditioned by the controversies raging around the key representatives of the so-called “Russian religious philosophy.”

VITALY TSELISHCHEV
Tomsk State University, Novosibirsk State University, Russia, leitval@gmail.com
HINTIKKA ON SOCRATIC EPISTEMOLOGY
Language: Russian
Keywords: Socrates, new developments in logic, epistemology, ontology.
In the second issue of the ninth volume of the journal the researchers from Novosibirsk and Tomsk continue their study of the ancient legal tradition “from the analytical point of view”. The volume is supplemented with various articles, translations, reviews and annotations. The journal is abstracted / indexed in The Philosopher’s Index and SCOPUS and available on-line at the following addresses: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/ (journal’s home page) and www.ceeol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).